

PLANNING APPLICATIONS COMMITTEE
17 September 2015

Item No:

UPRN

APPLICATION NO.

DATE VALID

15/P2556

02/07/2015

Address/Site 8 St Mary's Road, Wimbledon SW19 7BW

(Ward) Village

Proposal: Demolition of existing dwelling house and erection of a detached two storey dwelling house with accommodation at basement level and within the roof space together with the provision of off street parking, erection of front boundary treatment and associated landscaping.

Drawing Nos 598/X)1, P01A, P02A, Design and Access Statement, Lifetime Homes Audit Report, Basement Construction Method Statement

Contact Officer: Richard Allen (8545 3621)

RECOMMENDATION

GRANT Planning Permission subject to conditions

CHECKLIST INFORMATION

- Heads of agreement: no
- Is a screening opinion required: No
- Is an Environmental impact statement required: No
- Has an Environmental Impact Assessment been submitted: No
- Press notice- Yes
- Site notice-Yes
- Design Review Panel consulted-No
- Number neighbours consulted – 5
- External consultants: None
- Density: n/a
- Number of jobs created: n/a

- Archaeology Priority Zone: Yes

1. **INTRODUCTION**

- 1.1 This application has been brought to the Planning Applications Committee due to the number of objections received.

2. **SITE AND SURROUNDINGS**

The application site comprises a two storey detached house situated on the north-east side of St. Mary's Road at the junction with Church Hill. The adjacent site at 10 St Mary's Road is currently being redeveloped by the erection of a three storey (plus basement) detached dwelling house. To the south of the application site is 6 St Mary's Road, a large three storey detached dwelling. The application site is not within a conservation area but is close to the boundary with the Merton (Wimbledon North) Conservation Area.

3. **CURRENT PROPOSAL**

- 3.1 The current proposal involves the demolition of the existing dwelling house and the erection of a new dwelling house with accommodation over basement, ground, first floor and roof level.
- 3.2 The proposed house would be 11 metres in width at ground floor level and 10 meters in width at first floor level. It would have a maximum overall length of 20m from front bay window to rear elevation at ground floor level and 13.5m at first floor level. The house would have an eaves height of 6 metres and a hipped roof with an overall height of 9.2 metres. It would be set off the boundary with 6 St Mary's Road by 1.2 metres. The flank wall of the proposed house would abut the boundary with 10 St Mary's Road at ground floor level, with a 1 metre set back at first floor level. No.10 is set away from the boundary by 1.2 metres. The proposed house would be set back from the site frontage by between 7.5 and 9.5 metres. Off street parking would be provided within the front garden for two cars. New front boundary wall, railings and gates are also proposed. At the rear of the site approximately 250m² of amenity space would be provided.
- 3.3 Internally, at basement level a staff flat, playroom and storage areas would be provided. The staff flat would be accessed from an external staircase and light well from the front of the proposed house and linked into the house by an internal door within the basement. At ground floor level there would be an entrance hall, living room, study and living/kitchen/dining area, 3 bedrooms at first floor level, with a further two bedrooms within the roof space. Light and ventilation to the rooms within the roof space would be provided by dormer windows to the front and rear roof elevations. A single dormer would be

provided to the side roof elevation facing 10 St Mary's Road to provide headroom to a bathroom.

- 3.4 A traditional design approach has been adopted for the proposed house, with facing brickwork, and clay tiles roof and painted timber windows.

4. **PLANNING HISTORY**

- 4.1 The original house dates from 1955. A garage extension was approved in May 1969 (MER 291/69).
- 4.4 In June 1977 a single storey rear extension was approved (MER 328/77).
- 4.3 In June 1978 a dustbin store was approved (MER 163/78).
- 4.4 In March 2002 planning permission was granted for the erection of a part single/part two storey front extension (LBM Ref.01/P2125). July 2007 an application (07/P0369) was submitted to renew this permission. However, the application was withdrawn.
- 4.5 In August 2007 planning permission was granted for the erection of a new bathroom at first floor level and change of use of garage to sitting room at ground level and installation of new roof light to existing bathroom at first floor level (LBM Ref.07/P1853).
- 4.6 In May 2011 Planning permission was granted for the erection of an extension at first floor level and change of use of garage to sitting room at ground level, new roof light to existing bathroom at first floor level (Resubmission of previous lapsed permission 07/P1853) (LBM Ref.11/P0585).
- 4.7 In April 2015 a pre-application meeting was held to discuss the redevelopment of the site by the erection of a replacement dwelling house (LBM Ref.15/P1368).
- 4.8 **6 St Mary's Road**
Planning permission was granted in October 2001 for the redevelopment of the site by the erection of a detached dwelling house (LBM Ref.01/P1438).
- 4.9 **10 St Mary's Road**
It should be noted that a similar redevelopment proposal has been undertaken at 10 St Mary's Road involving demolition of the existing dwelling house and erection of a new detached dwelling house (with basement and accommodation within the roof space) and associated parking and landscaping (LBM Ref.13/P3848 amended by LBM Ref.14/P2534).

5. **CONSULTATION**

- 5.1 The application has been advertised by site and press notice and individual letters of consultation. Fourteen letters of objection have been received from

local residents, The Wimbledon Society and the Belvedere Estates Residents' Association. The grounds of objection are set out below:-

- The proposed house would result in loss of light to rooms on the ground and first floor of 6 St. Mary's Road.
- The current 'L' shaped foot print of number 8 should be maintained so as to maintain light to number 6 St Mary's Road.
- The proposed basement is substantial encompassing the entire footprint of the building and the foundations will impact upon numbers 6 and 29A.
- There has already been damage to walls and ceilings from basement works undertaken at number 10 last year.
- This is another proposal to squeeze a large four storey house (including basement) onto a plot that is not substantial.
- The proposed house is too large for the plot and more space should be allowed at the front and side of the property.
- The large house will result in loss of light to the neighbouring property.
- The basement construction may impact upon structural integrity of neighbouring properties.
- There are underground streams in the area and the basement may result in flooding.
- As numbers 8 and 10 are at a higher level than number 6 and the basement may cause the garden of number 6 to flood.
- There have been no long term studies as to the impact of basement construction on neighbouring properties.
- Neighbours did not fully appreciate the extent of the new house at 10 St Mary's Road. The new house at 10 St Mary's Road extends half way down the garden.
- Whilst the design of the proposed house is not unattractive, it is too large for the plot and more space should be allowed at the side and front of the property to reduce the impact of the house and to provide an attractive green frontage.
- The existing house is of no architectural quality and there are no objections to the principle of redevelopment. However, the application follows a recent trend of applications in the area (numbers 12A St Mary's Road and 25 Belvedere Drive) where the building line at the front is respected but the houses extend to the rear with multiple stories. The (rearward) projection would result in a loss of amenity to neighbours due to loss of light to garden and rear rooms. In this case number 6 will suffer.
- Plans should be scaled back to reduce the impact of the house on neighbours.
- The proposed development would cramp the surrounding houses and destroy the character of the road.

-If the proposed house sits further forward than neighbouring properties, this would cause concern.

5.2 The Wimbledon Society

The Society state that they cannot support the application in its present form for the following reasons:-

-The Design and Access Statement alludes to the development achieving Code level 5 of the Code for Sustainable Homes. However there is in indication as to how this will be met.

-There is no Hydrology Report despite there being underground streams in the area and that the application includes a basement.

-Off street parking for two vehicles means that there is little scope for soft landscaping.

-A cross section plan showing the relationship between neighbouring properties and the sloping nature of the site should be expected with a development of this scale.

5.3 Belvedere Estates Residents Association

-The proposal is twice the size of 6 St Mary's Road.

-The huge basement extends way beyond the large foot print of the house.

-The proposal would affect the amenities of number 6 St Mary's Road.

5.4 Amended Plans

In order to address the concerns of the objectors the architect submitted revised drawings. Details of the revisions are set out below.

-Single storey rear section of the house moved away from the boundary with 6 St. Mary's Road to improve the separation distances.

-The rear elevation drawing now shows the relationship between 6 St. Mary's road and the application site.

-The 'approved' foot print of 10 St. Mary's Road and the 'as built' foot print are now shown on the plans.

-The difference in ground levels between the application site and numbers 6 and 10 St. Mary's Road is shown on the rear elevation drawing.

5.5 Reconsultation

A reconsultation has been undertaken and any further representations will be included in the written update to Members.

6. POLICY CONTEXT

6.2 Adopted Merton Core Strategy (July 2011)

CS8 (Housing Choice), CS9 (Housing Provision), CS13 (Open Space, Nature Conservation, Leisure and Culture), CS14 (Design), CS15 (Climate Change) and CS20 (Parking)

6.3 Sites and Policies Plan (July 2014)

DM H2 (Housing Mix), DM H4 (Demolition and Redevelopment of a Single Dwelling house), DM 02 (Nature Conservation, Trees, Hedges and Landscape Features), DM D2 (Design Considerations in all Developments), DM D4 (Managing Heritage Assets), DM F2 (Sustainable Urban Drainage Systems) and DM T4 (Car Parking and Servicing Standards).

6.4 London Plan (March 2015)

3.8 (Housing Choice), 5.1 (Climate Change Mitigation), 5.3 (Sustainable Design and Construction), 7.6 (Architecture),

7. **PLANNING CONSIDERATIONS**

7.1 The main planning considerations concern the design of the proposed replacement house, Provision of basement accommodation, impact of the proposal upon the adjoining conservation area, neighbor amenity, parking, tree and sustainability issues.

7.2 Design Issues

The proposed house has been designed to respect the scale and massing of neighbouring properties. The application site is on a sloping part of the road and number 10 has a higher ridge height than the proposed house whilst the house at number 6 St Mary's Road has a slightly lower ridge height. The adopted design approach is for a house of traditional appearance, using facing brick and clay tiles and timber windows as used elsewhere in the vicinity of the application site and the neighbouring conservation area. The proposed house is therefore considered to be acceptable in design terms and the proposal complies with the aims of policy DM D2.

7.3 Provision of Basement Accommodation

Paragraphs 6.26-6.36 of policy DM D2 of the Sites and Policies Plan specifically refer to basement construction. The policy requires that all developments that involve the construction of basements are accompanied with a basement construction method statement. The architect has submitted a Basement Construction Method Statement produced by Structa Engineering Environment's which includes details of site soil/ground condition survey and details of basement construction methodology. The report concludes that 'based on the information available at this time it is possible to conclude that there is a safe and effective method of excavating and constructing the basement without significant impact on the public highway or neighbouring properties'. Therefore if planning permission were to be granted the Basement Construction Method Statement would form an approved document as part of

a planning permission. The extent of the basement does not conflict with the Council's guidelines, sitting under the footprint of the proposed new house except for the front lightwell.

The site investigation found the groundwater table to sit within the London Clay at a recorded depth of 6.2m and would therefore be approx. 2.4m below the base of the foundation. Negligible groundwater flow is therefore expected.

7.4 Impact upon Conservation Area

The application site is close to the boundary with the Merton (Wimbledon North) Conservation Area (the CA boundary is opposite the site). The proposed replacement house has been designed to reflect the character of other houses nearby and the facing materials (brickwork, clay tiles and timber doors and windows) reflect the materials those used in the adjacent conservation area. The proposal would not therefore, affect the character or appearance of the adjacent conservation area and is acceptable in terms of policy DM D4.

7.5 Neighbour Amenity Issues

The existing house is situated on a reasonably large plot and the scale of the proposed replacement house is considered to be reasonably related to the size of the plot. It retains a generous rear garden area commensurate with the size of the house and has a similar footprint to the recently approved house at 10 St Mary's Road

7.6 It should be noted that no.10 as built has been constructed in the wrong position and that this is currently under investigation – however, the footprint is no greater than approved, it has been constructed further into the plot than the approved siting. In terms of impact, the proposed house would only be slightly deeper than no.10 in its approved position at ground floor level and the upper levels would not project further than the existing house. The impact is therefore considered to be acceptable.

7.7 6 St Mary's Road is set at a lower level than the application site due to the downward slope of this section of St Mary's Road. The main additional bulk of the new house compared to existing arises from it being brought further forward on the plot – this element sits alongside the flank wall of no.6. At the front, the proposed house would still be set slightly behind no.6's front elevation. In terms of the relationship to the rear of no.6, the upper floors do not project any further back than the existing house and is also partly recessed further away. It is noted that the ground floor sits at a higher level to no 6 because of changes in ground levels. It would project 2.3m further back than the single storey element of the existing house but has been recessed away from the boundary by 2.5m at the point where it would extend beyond the two storey flank wall of the existing house. The orientation is such that there is not considered to be any unacceptable additional impact in terms of light or overshadowing. Officers do not consider that the impact of the new house in terms of any loss of light, overshadowing or outlook, is sufficient to warrant refusal.

7.6 Windows within the side elevation of the proposed house at first floor level would be glazed with obscure glass. The side dormer window facing 10 St Mary's Road would also be obscure glazed. There is not considered to be any unacceptable impact in relation to privacy. It is also noted that neighbours have expressed concern regarding the potential impact of the proposed basement construction upon neighbouring properties. However, as part of the application, the architect has submitted a Basement construction Method Statement. The Basement Construction Method Statement concluded that 'there is a safe and effective method of excavating and constructing the basement without significant impact upon the public highway or neighboring properties'. The proposal is therefore considered to be acceptable in terms of policy DM D2.

7.6 Parking

The proposal would incorporate two off-street car parking spaces within the front garden accessed by a single vehicular crossover from St Mary's Road. The proposed access and parking arrangements are considered to be acceptable and accord with policy CS20.

7.7 Trees

There are no existing trees on the site that are protected by tree preservation order (TPO) or any trees that would be affected by the proposed development. The proposal is therefore acceptable in terms of policy DM 02.

7.8 Sustainability Issues

The Government removed the requirement for compliance with the Code for Sustainable Homes on 26 March 2015, as part of the Deregulation Act 2015. However, in the absence of any other replacement guidance, the Code for Sustainable Homes standard has been adopted for this development. Policy CS15 of the Code for Sustainable Homes Level 4 required all new developments to achieve Code level 4. Policy DM H4 of the Sites and Policies Plan states that a proposal to demolish and rebuild a single dwelling will be required to enhance the environmental performance of the new development beyond minimum requirements. The policy requires that Carbon Dioxide emissions to be limited in line with Code for sustainable Homes level 5. Notwithstanding that the Government removed the requirement of compliance with the Code for Sustainable Homes; the architect has stated that using passive means for achieving energy efficiency will be the starting point with low U values for the external fabric of the building, improved air tightness, reduced thermal bridging and making effective use of resources and materials, minimizing water and CO2 emissions. The architect has also confirmed that the design of the proposed house meets the Lifetime Homes criteria.

SUSTAINABILITY AND ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT ASSESSMENT REQUIREMENTS

8.1 The proposal does not constitute Schedule 1 or Schedule 2 development. Accordingly there is no requirement for an EIA submission.

9.0 **CONCLUSION**

9.1 The proposal has been carefully considered in relation to its impact on neighbours and is considered to be acceptable in this regard. The house is considered to be of an appropriate scale and design for its setting within the streetscene and would not adversely affect the setting of the adjacent Merton (Wimbledon North) Conservation Area. Accordingly, it is recommended that planning permission be granted.

RECOMMENDATION:

GRANT PLANNING PERMISSION subject to the following conditions:-

1. A.1 Commencement of Development
3. A.7 Approved Plans
2. B.1 (Approval of Facing Materials)
3. B.4 (Site Surface Treatment)
4. B.5 (Boundary Treatment)
5. C.2 (No Permitted Development Doors/Windows)
6. C.4 (Obscure Glazing – First Floor Side Windows and Side (Bathroom) Dormer Window Facing 10 St Mary's Road)
7. C.7 (Refuse and Recycling-Implementation)
8. D.9 (External Lighting)
9. D.11 (Construction Times)
10. F.1 (Landscaping Scheme)
11. F.2 (Landscaping Implementation)
12. H.7 (Cycle Parking Implementation)
13. H.9 Construction Vehicles)
14. J.1 (Lifetime Homes)
15. Prior to commencement of development, a detailed Basement Construction Method Statement shall be submitted to and be approved in writing by the

Local Planning Authority and the basement construction undertaken in accordance with the approved details.

Reason for condition: In the interest of neighbour amenity and to comply with policy DM D2.

16. Sustainability –energy and water to code 4 equivalent

17. Detailed drainage (SUDS)

. INF.1 Party Wall Act

INF.8 Construction of Vehicular Access

INF.12 Works Affecting the Public Highway